Implementing the Collections Model in RDA

Part 2: Subject Hierarchy Revisions to Accommodate Collection Level Description

Prepared by the Technical Working Group for the October 2021 Meeting of the RDA Steering Committee

Abstract

This proposal set is the 2nd in a series of 4 to address the coverage of the concept of "collections" and "collection level description" (CLD) in RDA. This set builds on the proposals submitted for the implementation of the collections model and lays the groundwork for a 3rd set of proposals by adding and amending elements within a section of the RDA entity subject hierarchies and revising definitions of concepts in RDA Terms in order to support the creation of metadata description sets that describe collections and the relationship between collections and their descriptions.

Background

The implementation of the IFLA-LRM (LRM) treatment of aggregates in RDA during the 3R project identified a requirement that RDA should also develop a treatment for "collections." This requirement is important for realizing the strategy of increasing adoption of RDA by cultural heritage institutions who have as their focus the description and access of collections.

A set of proposals for implementation of the collections model has been submitted as RSC/TechnicalWG/2021/2 Part 1. This set of proposals provides several recommendations for revising the already existing infrastructure in RDA for relating an RDA entity to works that describe that entity. These revisions are necessary to fully implement collection level description in RDA, that is, the *metadata works* that describe collections and how they are related to the collections they describe.

Proposals that implement collection descriptions proper in RDA are the subject of the 3rd proposal in this set.

Structure

Recommendations for changes to RDA are provided in the Justifications section. The impact of changes to the Toolkit text are provided in Appendix 1. Templates of standard Toolkit text are provided in Appendix 2.

Justifications

Descriptive works

RDA provides relationship elements for an RDA entity that is described by a work. In other words, the entity is the target of a descriptive work. These relationships can broadly be called "descriptive work elements."

Review of the descriptive work elements have revealed several issues related to clarity and consistency of labels and definitions and resolution of these issues should lead to better understanding and aid in the translation of these elements.

Recommendation 1: **Amend the label for "RDA entity critiqued in" by replacing 'in' with 'by' in this label and its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes. Amend the definitions of the element, its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes, and their inverses for consistency and clarity.**

Recommendation 2: **Amend the label for "RDA entity described in" by replacing 'in' with 'by' in this label and its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes. Amend the definitions of the element and its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes.**

Recommendation 3: **Amend the label for "RDA entity evaluated in" by replacing 'in' with 'by' in this label and its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes. Amend the definitions of the element, its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes, and their inverses for consistency and clarity.**

Recommendation 4: **Amend the label for "RDA entity reviewed in" by replacing 'in' with 'by' in this label and its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes. Amend the definitions of the element, its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes, and their inverses for consistency and clarity.**

The elements "item critiqued in," item evaluated in," and "item reviewed in" and their inverses have no utility and should be deprecated. Critiques, evaluations, and reviews of an item in this sense must also apply to all exemplars of the manifestation, which means that the manifestation elements should be used.

Recommendation 5: **Deprecate the elements "item critiqued in," "item evaluated in," and "item reviewed in" and their inverses.**

The current hierarchy for the elements amended in recommendations 1 and 4 is also in need of revision. The current flat hierarchy is a barrier to the accommodation of new elements needed for collection

descriptions. The elements using "critiqued" or "reviewed" and their inverses should become element subtypes of the elements using "evaluated" and its inverses.

The work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes of "RDA entity evaluated by"/"evaluation of RDA entity" are in error regarding their broader element. They are currently element subtypes of "[work, expression, manifestation] described by"/"description of [work, expression, manifestation]" and should be element subtypes of "subject [work, expression, manifestation] of"/"subject [work, expression, manifestation]."

The general structure of the new hierarchy would be:

- (RDA Entity) subject RDA entity of (Work)
  - RDA entity described by
  - RDA entity evaluated by
    - RDA entity critiqued by
    - RDA entity reviewed by

Recommendation 6: Revise the hierarchy for the elements amended in recommendation 1 to be element subtypes of the elements using the "evaluation of/evaluation by" semantics.

Recommendation 7: Revise the hierarchy for the elements amended in recommendation 4 to be element subtypes of the elements using the "evaluation of/evaluation by" semantics.

Recommendation 8: Revise the hierarchy for work, expression, and manifestation subtypes of "RDA entity evaluated by" and "evaluation of RDA entity" to be element subtypes of the work, expression, and manifestation subtypes of "subject RDA entity of" and "subject RDA entity" respectively.

There is also an argument that the specific elements and their inverses using "critiqued" and "reviewed" are too specific and only have marginal utility. These elements and their inverses could be soft-deprecated in favor of the broader element using "evaluation."

Question 1: Does the RSC wish to soft-deprecate the elements using "critiqued" and "reviewed" and their inverses in favor of the element using "evaluated" and its inverses?

Metadata works

RDA defines a *metadata work* as "A work that is a metadata statement or a metadata description set."

RDA currently does not provide any elements that relate an entity to a *metadata work* that describes the entity. Elements like the ones described should be added to support not just traditional bibliographic description, but collection level description as well.

A *metadata work* is a kind of descriptive work. An element relating an entity to a metadata work about the entity fits into the semantics of the "RDA entity described by"/"description of RDA entity" hierarchy. Therefore the new elements should be an element subtypes of these for every RDA entity.

Recommendation 9: **Add new elements to every entity to relate an entity to a metadata work.**

Analysis of the two kinds of metadata works, *metadata description set* and *metadata statement* show that they can be treated as being embodied in an aggregate. A manifestation of a *metadata description set* (e.g., a catalog record) is an aggregate. Each manifestation of a *metadata statement* (e.g. an RDF triple) is the embodiment of an expression that is aggregated. The aggregating work, the plan for the selection, layout, and ordering of metadata statements, is the *metadata description set*.

The definitions in RDA Terms of *metadata description set* and *metadata work* should be amended to reflect the above analysis. In addition to this, a scope note should be added for *metadata description set* to describe that such a plan may be used in an *application profile*.

Recommendation 10: **Amend the definition and add a scope note for *metadata description set*. Amend the definition of *metadata statement*.**

Impact

The adoption of the recommendations in this proposal are necessary for implementing collection level description in RDA.

The revision of a portion of the subject hierarchy will allow for better understanding of the utility of these elements by users and will also accommodate the recommendations for collection-level description proper in the 3rd proposal set. A survey of the use of the affected elements has revealed little to no use of the existing relationships, so there should be little impact on current cataloging processes.

The revision of terms and definitions in the subject hierarchies and in RDA Terms will allow for a better understanding of the semantics and intended uses of several of the subject elements and will aid in the understanding of *metadata work* and its associated concepts *metadata statement* and *metadata description set*.

The recommendations also fill in a major lacuna in RDA: while RDA provides relationships and attributes to describe the resources cultural heritage institutions collect and the entities often associated with them, RDA is nearly silent about the thing it is intended to produce: *metadata description sets*. The recommendations make clear that the descriptions of an entity are embodied in an aggregate. It embodies expressions of aggregated works, each a *metadata statement*. The plan for selecting and arranging the *metadata statements* in the aggregate is the *metadata description set*, the *aggregating work*.

The final 2 parts of this proposal provide recommendations for relating collections to kinds of *metadata description sets* and for relating agents responsible for creating collections and metadata description sets.

Summary of recommendations

Recommendation 1: Amend the label for "RDA entity critiqued in" by replacing 'in' with 'by' in this label and its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes. Amend the definitions of the element, its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes, and their inverses for consistency and clarity.

Recommendation 2: Amend the label for "RDA entity described in" by replacing 'in' with 'by' in this label and its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes. Amend the definitions of the element and its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes.

Recommendation 3: Amend the label for "RDA entity evaluated in" by replacing 'in' with 'by' in this label and its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes. Amend the definitions of the element, its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes, and their inverses for consistency and clarity.

Recommendation 4: Amend the label for "RDA entity reviewed in" by replacing 'in' with 'by' in this label and its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes. Amend the definitions of the element, its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes, and their inverses for consistency and clarity.

Recommendation 5: Deprecate the elements "item critiqued in," "item evaluated in," and "item reviewed in" and their inverses.

Recommendation 6: Revise the hierarchy for the elements amended in recommendation 1 to be element subtypes of the elements using the "evaluation of/evaluation by" semantics.

Recommendation 7: Revise the hierarchy for the elements amended in recommendation 4 to be element subtypes of the elements using the "evaluation of/evaluation by" semantics.

Recommendation 8: Revise the hierarchy for work, expression, and manifestation subtypes of "RDA entity evaluated by" and "evaluation of RDA entity" to be element subtypes of the work, expression, and manifestation subtypes of "subject RDA entity of" and "subject RDA entity" respectively.

Question 1: Does the RSC wish to soft-deprecate the elements using "critiqued" and "reviewed" and their inverses in favor of the element using "evaluated" and its inverses?

Recommendation 9: **Add new elements to every entity to relate an entity to a metadata work.**

Recommendation 10: **Amend the definition and add a scope note for** *metadata description set*. **Amend the definition of** *metadata statement*.

Appendix 1: Recommendations in Toolkit

Recommendation 1: **Amend the label for "RDA entity critiqued in" by replacing 'in' with 'by' in this label and its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes. Amend the definitions of the element, its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes, and their inverses for consistency and clarity.**

Recommendation 6: **Revise the hierarchy for the elements amended in recommendation 1 to be element subtypes of the elements using the "evaluation of/evaluation by" semantics.**

	Current	New
Toolkit label	RDA entity critiqued in	RDA entity critiqued by
Toolkit definition	A work that contains a critical evaluation of a described RDA entity.	A work that is a critical evaluation of an RDA entity.
Element subtype of	subject RDA entity of	RDA entity evaluated by

	Current	New
Toolkit label	work critiqued in	work critiqued by
Toolkit definition	A work that contains a critical evaluation of a described work.	A work that is a critical evaluation of a work.
Element subtype of	work described in	work evaluated by

	Current	New
Toolkit label	expression critiqued in	expression critiqued by
Toolkit definition	A work that contains a critical evaluation of a described expression.	A work that is a critical evaluation of an expression.
Element subtype of	expression described in	expression evaluated by

	Current	New

Toolkit label	manifestation critiqued in	manifestation critiqued by
Toolkit definition	A work that contains a critical evaluation of a described manifestation.	A work that is a critical evaluation of a manifestation.
Element subtype of	manifestation described in	manifestation evaluated by

	Current	New
Toolkit label	critique of RDA entity	
Toolkit definition	An RDA entity used as a basis for a critical evaluation.	An RDA entity that is critically evaluated by a work.
Element subtype of	subject RDA entity	evaluation of RDA entity

	Current	New
Toolkit label	critique of work	
Toolkit definition	A work used as a basis for a critical evaluation.	A work that is critically evaluated by a work.
Element subtype of	description of work	evaluation of work

	Current	New
Toolkit label	critique of expression	
Toolkit definition	An expression used as a basis for a critical evaluation.	An expression that is critically evaluated by a work.
Element subtype of	description of expression	evaluation of expression

	Current	New
Toolkit label	critique of manifestation	
Toolkit definition	A manifestation used as a basis for a critical evaluation.	A manifestation that is critically evaluated by a work.

Element subtype of	description of manifestation	evaluation of manifestation

Recommendation 2: Amend the label for RDA entity described in by replacing 'in' with 'by' in this label and its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes. Amend the definitions of the element and its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes.

	Current	New
Toolkit label	RDA entity described in	RDA entity described by
Toolkit definition	A work that describes a described RDA entity.	A work that is a description of an RDA entity.

	Current	New
Toolkit label	work described in	work described by
Toolkit definition	A work that describes a described work.	A work that is a description of a work.

	Current	New
Toolkit label	expression described in	expression described by
Toolkit definition	A work that describes a described expression.	A work that is a description of an expression.

	Current	New
Toolkit label	manifestation described in	manifestation described by
Toolkit definition	A work that describes a described manifestation.	A work that is a description of a manifestation.

Recommendation 3: Amend the label for "RDA entity evaluated in" by replacing 'in' with 'by' in this label and its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes. Amend the definitions of the element, its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes, and their inverses for consistency and clarity.

Recommendation 8: **Revise the hierarchy for work, expression, and manifestation subtypes of "RDA entity evaluated by" and "evaluation of RDA entity" to be element subtypes of the work, expression, and manifestation subtypes of "subject RDA entity of" and "subject RDA entity" respectively.**

	Current	New
Toolkit label	RDA entity evaluated in	RDA entity evaluated by
Toolkit definition	A work that examines or judges a described RDA entity.	A work that is an examination or judgement of an RDA entity.
Subtype of	subject RDA entity of	

	Current	New
Toolkit label	work evaluated in	work evaluated by
Toolkit definition	A work that examines or judges a described work.	A work that is an examination or judgement of a work.
Subtype of	work described in	subject work of

	Current	New
Toolkit label	expression evaluated in	expression evaluated by
Toolkit definition	A work that examines or judges a described expression.	A work that is an examination or judgement of an expression.
Subtype of	expression described in	subject expression of

	Current	New
Toolkit label	manifestation evaluated in	manifestation evaluated by
Toolkit definition	A work that examines or judges a described manifestation.	A work that is an examination or judgement of a manifestation.
Subtype of	manifestation described in	subject manifestation of

	Current	New
Toolkit label	evaluation of RDA entity	
Toolkit definition	An RDA entity that is examined or judged.	An RDA entity that is examined or judged by a work.
Subtype of	subject RDA entity	

	Current	New
Toolkit label	evaluation of work	
Toolkit definition	A work that is examined or judged.	A work that is examined or judged by a work.
Subtype of	description of work	subject work

	Current	New
Toolkit label	evaluation of expression	
Toolkit definition	An expression that is examined or judged.	An expression that is examined or judged by a work.
Subtype of	description of expression	subject expression

	Current	New
Toolkit label	evaluation of manifestation	
Toolkit definition	A manifestation that is examined or judged.	A manifestation that is examined or judged by a work.
Subtype of	description of manifestation	subject manifestation

Recommendation 4: **Amend the label for "RDA entity reviewed in" by replacing 'in' with 'by' in this label and its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes. Amend the definitions of the element, its work, expression, and manifestation element subtypes, and their inverses for consistency and clarity.**

Recommendation 7: **Revise the hierarchy for the elements amended in recommendation 4 to be element subtypes of the elements using the "evaluation of/evaluation by" semantics.**

	Current	New
Toolkit label	RDA entity reviewed in	RDA entity reviewed by
Toolkit definition	A work that contains a brief evaluation of a described RDA entity.	A work that is a brief evaluation of an RDA entity.
Element subtype of	subject RDA entity of	RDA entity evaluated by

	Current	New
Toolkit label	work reviewed in	work reviewed by
Toolkit definition	A work that contains a brief evaluation of a described work.	A work that is a brief evaluation of a work.
Element subtype of	work described in	work evaluated by

	Current	New
Toolkit label	expression reviewed in	expression reviewed by
Toolkit definition	A work that contains a brief evaluation of a described expression.	A work that is a brief evaluation of an expression.
Element subtype of	expression described in	expression evaluated by

	Current	New
Toolkit label	manifestation reviewed in	manifestation reviewed by
Toolkit definition	A work that contains a brief evaluation of a described manifestation.	A work that is a brief evaluation of a manifestation.
Element subtype of	manifestation described in	manifestation evaluated by

	Current	New
Toolkit label	review of RDA entity	
Toolkit definition	An RDA entity used as a basis for a brief evaluation.	An RDA entity that is briefly evaluated by a work.
Element subtype of	subject RDA entity	evaluation of RDA entity

	Current	New
Toolkit label	review of work	
Toolkit definition	A work used as a basis for a brief evaluation.	A work that is briefly evaluated by a work.
Element subtype of	description of work	evaluation of work

	Current	New
Toolkit label	review of expression	
Toolkit definition	An expression used as a basis for a brief evaluation.	An expression that is briefly evaluated by a work.
Element subtype of	description of expression	evaluation of expression

	Current	New
Toolkit label	review of manifestation	
Toolkit definition	A manifestation used as a basis for a brief evaluation.	A manifestation that is briefly evaluated by a work.
Element subtype of	description of manifestation	evaluation of manifestation

Recommendation 5: **Deprecate the elements "item critiqued in," "item evaluated in," and "item reviewed in" and their inverses.**

Remove from RDA Toolkit the following elements:

Toolkit label
item critiqued in
item evaluated in
item reviewed in
critique of item
evaluation of item
review of item

Recommendation 9: **Add new elements to every entity to relate an entity to a metadata work, along with inverses.**

Toolkit label	RDA entity described with metadata by
Toolkit definition	A work that is a metadata work for an RDA entity.
Domain	RDA Entity
Range	Work
subtype of	RDA entity described by
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	work described with metadata by
Toolkit definition	A work that is a metadata work for a work.

Domain	Work
Range	Work
subtype of	work described by
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	expression described with metadata by
Toolkit definition	A work that is a metadata work for an expression.
Domain	Expression
Range	Work
subtype of	expression described by
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	manifestation described with metadata by
Toolkit definition	A work that is a metadata work for a manifestation.
Domain	Manifestation
Range	Work
subtype of	manifestation described by
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	item described with metadata by
Toolkit definition	A work that is a metadata work for an item.
Domain	Item
Range	Work
subtype of	item described by
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	agent described with metadata by
Toolkit definition	A work that is a metadata work for an agent.
Domain	Agent
Range	Work
subtype of	agent described by
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	collective agent described with metadata by
Toolkit definition	A work that is a metadata work for a collective agent.
Domain	Collective agent
Range	Work
subtype of	collective agent described by
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	corporate body described with metadata by
Toolkit definition	A work that is a metadata work for a corporate body.
Domain	Corporate body
Range	Work
subtype of	corporate body described by
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	family described with metadata by
Toolkit definition	A work that is a metadata work for a family.
Domain	Family

Range	Work
subtype of	family described by
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	person described with metadata by
Toolkit definition	A work that is a metadata work for a person.
Domain	Person
Range	Work
subtype of	person described by
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	nomen described with metadata by
Toolkit definition	A work that is a metadata work for a nomen.
Domain	Nomen
Range	Work
subtype of	nomen described by
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	place described with metadata by
Toolkit definition	A work that is a metadata work for a place.
Domain	Place
Range	Work
subtype of	place described by
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	timespan described with metadata by
Toolkit definition	A work that is a metadata work for a timespan.
Domain	Timespan
Range	Work
subtype of	timespan described by
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	metadata description of RDA entity
Toolkit definition	An RDA entity that is described by a metadata work.
Domain	Work
Range	RDA Entity
subtype of	description of RDA entity
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	metadata description of work
Toolkit definition	A work that is described by a metadata work.
Domain	Work
Range	Work
subtype of	description of work
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	metadata description of expression
Toolkit definition	An expression that is described by a metadata work.
Domain	Work
Range	Expression

subtype of	description of expression
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	metadata description of manifestation
Toolkit definition	A manifestation that is described by a metadata work.
Domain	Work
Range	Manifestation
subtype of	description of manifestation
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	metadata description of item
Toolkit definition	An item that is described by a metadata work.
Domain	Work
Range	Item
subtype of	description of item
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	metadata description of agent
Toolkit definition	An agent that is described by a metadata work.
Domain	Work
Range	Agent
subtype of	description of agent
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	metadata description of collective agent

Toolkit definition	A collective agent that is described by a metadata work.
Domain	Work
Range	Collective agent
subtype of	description of collective agent
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	metadata description of corporate body
Toolkit definition	A corporate body that is described by a metadata work.
Domain	Work
Range	Corporate body
subtype of	description of corporate body
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	metadata description of family
Toolkit definition	A family that is described by a metadata work.
Domain	Work
Range	Family
subtype of	description of family
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	metadata description of person
Toolkit definition	A person that is described by a metadata work.
Domain	Work
Range	Person
subtype of	description of person

Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	metadata description of nomen
Toolkit definition	A nomen that is described by a metadata work.
Domain	Work
Range	Nomen
subtype of	description of nomen
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	metadata description of place
Toolkit definition	A place that is described by a metadata work.
Domain	Work
Range	Place
subtype of	description of place
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Toolkit label	metadata description of timespan
Toolkit definition	An timespan that is described by a metadata work.
Domain	Work
Range	Timespan
subtype of	description of timespan
Toolkit text	Standard text for relationship elements. See template.

Recommendation 10: **Amend the definition and add a scope note for *metadata description set*.
Amend the definition of *metadata statement*.**

	Current	New
Label	metadata description set	
Definition	One or more metadata statements that describe and relate individual instances of one or more RDA entities.	A metadata work that is an aggregating work that is a plan to select and arrange one or more expressions of one or more metadata statements and embody them in an aggregate.
Scope notes		The plan may be part of an application profile.

	Current	New
Label	metadata statement	
Definition	A piece of metadata that assigns a value to an RDA element that describes an individual instance of an RDA entity.	A metadata work that is a piece of metadata that assigns a value to an RDA element that describes an individual instance of an RDA entity.

Appendix 2: Toolkit Templates

\<relationship element>

Definition and Scope

\<Auto-generated from RDA Vocabularies>

Element Reference

\<Auto-generated from RDA Vocabularies>

Prerecording

Recording

Record this element as a value of \<Domain entity>: \<appellation of entity label> or as an IRI.

Recording an unstructured description

Record an unstructured description for a **related \<domain entity>** as a value of \<Domain entity>: \<title or name of entity label>.

For general guidance on unstructured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods. Recording an unstructured description.

Recording a structured description

Record a structured description for a **related \<domain entity>** as a value of \<Domain entity>: \<access point for entity label>.

For general guidance on structured descriptions, see Guidance: Recording methods. Recording a structured description.

Recording an identifier

Record an identifier for a **related \<domain entity>** as a value of \<Domain entity>: \<identifier for entity label>.

For general guidance on identifiers, see Guidance: Recording methods. Recording an identifier.

Recording an IRI

Record an IRI for a related expression as a *real-world object*.

For general guidance on IRIs, see Guidance: Recording methods. Recording an IRI.

Related Elements

<Auto-generated from RDA Vocabularies>